DAVID Y. IGE GOVERNOR OF HAWAII





### STATE OF HAWAII DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION KAKUHIHEWA BUILDING 601 KAMOKILA BLVD, STE 555 KAPOLEI, HAWAII 96707

#### SUZANNE D. CASE

CHAIRPERSON
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

ROBERT K. MASUDA FIRST DEPUTY

JEFFREY T. PEARSON, P.E. DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT
ENGINEERING
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION
LAND
STATE PARKS

# MINUTES (REVISED FINAL) HAWAII HISTORIC PLACES REVIEW BOARD MEETING

**DATE:** Friday June 1, 2018 TIME: 9:30AM-3:30PM

Department of Hawaiian Homelands PLACE:

> Hale Ponoi Meeting Room 91-5420 Kapolei Parkway Kapolei, Hawai'i 96707

The following were in attendance:

**MEMBERS:** Nancy Peacock, AIA CHAIR

Ikaika Bantolina Matt McDermott Katie Stephens William Souza Alton Okinaka Pat Griffin Paul Morgan

George Casen

Alan S. Downer, Administrator **STAFF:** 

> Chandra Hirotsu, Secretary III Regina Hilo, Burial Sites Specialist

# **PUBLIC/ HOMEOWNERS/ NOMINATORS:**

Lorraine Minatoshi Stephen Long Mr.Williams Andrea Nanoskar Laura Ruby Natalie Besl

Don Hibbard

The meeting was called to order at 9:30 a.m. by Chair Nancy Peacock The review board members introduced themselves.

#### A. AGENDA

Approval of the June 1, 2018. Agenda

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to move items C to the end

of the agenda. And to approve the amended agenda.

Seconded: Pat Griffin

<u>Vote:</u> 9-0; **All in favor** (Peacock, Souza, Bantolina, Stephens, Casen,

Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott, Griffin). Motion carries.

# **B. MINUTES**

Approval/Amendments of the May 31, 2018 Limited Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **Bill Souza** to approve minutes with

changes.

Seconded: Paul Morgan

<u>Vote:</u> 6-0-3; **All in favor** (Griffin, Morgan, McDermott, Peacock,

Stephens, Souza). Abstained (Bantolina, Casen, Okinaka) Motion

carries.

### C. SHPD REPORT

Moved to end of nominations

### **D. NOMINATIONS**

Hawaii Public Library Honoka'a Branch

45-3380 Mamane Street #3 Honoka'a, Hawaii 96727 (3) 4-5-06:003

This nomination was presented by Laura Ruby

#### 1 June 2018

Hawaii Historic Places Review Board Meeting

Questions:

Mr. McDermott: What is the significance in the criteria? A or C

Ms. Ruby: Both A&C

Mr. McDermott: Is this a district nomination?

Ms. Ruby: No, there was an attempt on the 70's. There wasn't enough support h the district

nomination. Therefore, each property would be documented individually.

Mr. Casen: Was there a map showing the location of the library on the strip of road.

Ms. Peacock: Yes, it is in the report. Its more on the Hilo side.

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to list the building to the

Hawaii Register under Criterion A/C at the local level and

recommend it to the National Register.

Seconded: Pat Griffin
Criterion: A & C
Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 9-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott

Peacock, Bantolina, Casen, Souza). Motion carries.

### Sueoka Market \* REVISED\*

5392 Koloa Road Koloa, Hawaii 96813 (4) 2-8-008:035

This nomination was presented by Lorraine Minatoishi

## Questions:

Ms. Stephens: There some pictures from the 1960's & 1980's, when was the lava rock put in?

Ms. Minatoishi: The lava was the original portion of the building.

Ms. Stephens: It seems unusual with the lava rock

Mr. Casen: Is there a way to see the exact date that the lava wall was constructed? If it was done

more than 50 years ago then it would be historic.

Action: A motion was made by **Katie Stephens** to defer the nomination to allow

nominators to determine what Criteria to submit the nomination under.

1 June 2018

Hawaii Historic Places Review Board Meeting

Seconded: Paul Morgan

<u>Criterion:</u> A & C <u>Level of Significance:</u> Local

Vote: 7-1-1; All in favor (Griffin, Stephens, Okinaka, Casen, Peacock, Souza) No

(Bantolina) Recuse (McDermott) Motion carries nomination was deferred.

### **Iida Residence**

1920 Pauoa Rd. Honolulu, Hawaii (1) 2-2-010:019

This nomination was presented by Lorraine Minatoishi/Natalie Besl

### Questions:

Ms. Peacock: It looks like the covered lanai has been added.

Ms. Minatoishi: Owner recollection was the lanai was always being there.

Mr.Casen: Oral history is very important, sometimes you have to confirm it from tax records and other property records.

Ms. Minatoshi: Field books and property records shoe permit and apps were destroyed.

Mr. Casen: Emphasized the importance to have more information about the property for future generations so that it will all be documented.

Mr. Okinaka: Asked for a floor plan for the separate rear structure. Since they don't want to let us in, at least will be able to see that it is a residence.

Ms. Stephens: Asked if some photos could also be included of the rear structure inside and out.

Action: A motion was made by **George Casen** to defer the nomination to

allow nominators to add Criteria C and to remove rear structure

from nomination. And do more research on the lanai.

Seconded: Katie Stephens

<u>Criterion:</u> B & C <u>Level of Significance:</u> Local

<u>Vote:</u> 7-2; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Okinaka, Casen, Peacock,

McDermott, Souza) No (Bantolina, Morgan) Motion carries

nomination was deferred.

#### Otsubo Monument Works\* REVISED\*

944 Coolidge Street Honolulu, Hawaii 96822 (1) 2-7-09:034

This nomination was presented by Laura Ruby.

## Questions:

Mr. Casen: Excellent research on the nomination, suggest using Criterion D.

Mr. McDermott: The nomination does not have much of a chance as Criterion A. Also suggest considering Criterion D. if you want to put it under Criterion A you need a lot more information.

Ms. Ruby: Because of the site history and the artifacts that's why I put it under A.

Mr. Morgan: You said there's nothing to look at, but I would like to see some photos.

Ms. Ruby: I can send you some photos. Head stones were moved. Contractor would not let me do more.

\*Ms. Ruby: Stated after the vote that she would like to meet with Ms. Lebo regarding changes to be made to the nomination.

Ms. Peacock: Recommending exterior viewing photos.

Action: A motion was made by **Matt McDermott** to defer the nomination

and to re-submit it under Criteria D.

Seconded: George Casen

<u>Criterion:</u> C Level of Significance: Local

<u>Vote:</u> 9-0; **All in Favor** (Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott

Peacock, Bantolina, Griffin, Casen, Souza). Motion carries.

### John C. Cook Residence

2536 Manoa Road Honolulu, Hawaii 96822 (1) 2-9-009:006

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

### Questions:

Mr. Souza: What was the owner talking about the Japanese architecture of the house?

Mr. Hibbard: The owner was talking about the interlocking components and beams.

Ms. Peacock: The nomination was missing floor plans and photos of the exterior shots.

Mr. Hibbard: I will resubmit to the state.

Mr. Stephens: The house was in beautiful condition and well maintained.

Mr. McDermott: Was the garage original?

Mr. Hibbard: No, it was added later.

Action: A motion was made by **Pat Griffin** to list the residence to the

Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criterion C at the local

level and further recommend it to the National Register.

Seconded: Katie Stephens

<u>Criterion:</u> C Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 9-1; All in Favor (Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott

Peacock, Griffin, Casen, Souza). Abstained (Bantolina) Motion

carries.

### **Earle Ernst Residence**

3293 Huelani Drive

Honolulu, Hawaii 96822

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Action: A motion was made by **Pat Griffin** to amend the original listing

and place it under Criterion B&C to the Hawaii Register of

Historic Places at the local level and further recommend it to the

National Register.

Seconded:

<u>Criterion:</u> B & C <u>Level of Significance:</u> Local

Vote: 8-1; **All in Favor** (Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott

Peacock, Bantolina, Griffin, Casen, Souza). Motion carries.

# Fish House No. 1 (Rutgard Residence)

4380 Amaama Road Hanalei, Hawaii 96714 (4) 5-5-004:008

This nomination was presented by Steven Long

### Discussion:

Recommendations were made by the board for this nomination. This was the Mr. Longs first time submitting a nomination. The board was not able to visit this property. The board members asked to see the version of the nomination that was given to Kauai Historic Foundation. Mr. Long is going to work with SHPD on improving his nomination, re-submitting it later date.

Action: A motion was made by **Pat Griffin** to defer the nomination to

allow owner to revise nomination and re-submit.

Seconded: Ikaika Bantolina

<u>Criteria:</u> C Level of Significance: Local

<u>Vote:</u> 9-0; **All in Favor** (Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott

Peacock, Bantolina, Griffin, Casen, Souza). Motion carries.

### **3019 Hibiscus Drive**

Honolulu, Hawaii 96815 (1)3-1-034:033

No presentation

Action: A motion was made by **Pat Griffin** to list the residence to the

Hawaii Register under Criterion C and recommend to the National

Register

Seconded: Katie Stephens

<u>Criteria:</u> C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-2; All in Favor (Stephens, Okinaka, McDermott Peacock,

Griffin, Casen, Souza) No (Morgan, Bantolina). Motion carries.

### F. SHPD REPORT

Dr. Downer: The Federal budget was passed with a additional 15k. The State Budget passed and is at the Governor's office. We have 9 positions in the budget. We also are seeking \$450k for Phase IV of our Data Management program. \$125k for the planning of our Hilo office. Also discussed the effects of the lava, flooding with FEMA

# **G. 2018 MEETING DATES**

Friday December 9- 2016

The November 30, 2018 meeting agenda will be available on the SHPD website 30 days pirto the meeting.

# H. SUBMITTED NOMINATIONS FOR NOVEMBER 30, 2018 MEETING

Action: A motion was made by **George Casen** to hold a limited meeting

on Thursday August 23, 2018 of the Oahu properties. The purpose of the site visits is for privacy, safety, access and liability issues.

Seconded: Pat Griffin

<u>Vote:</u> 9-0; **All in Favor** (Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott

Peacock, Bantolina, Griffin, Casen, Souza). Motion carries.

# H. MEETING ADJOURNED

Action: A motion was made **Pat Griffin** to adjourn the meeting.

Seconded: Alton Okinaka

<u>Vote:</u> The Board members voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 2pm

Respectfully Submitted,

Chandra Hirotsu Secretary III State Historic Preservation Division